23rd ESHET Annual Conference Université de Lille 23-25 May 2019

Cameralist Ideas in Enlightened Reformism in Portugal: the diplomat Rodrigo de Souza Coutinho and his circuits of intellectual exchange¹

Alexandre Mendes Cunha (UFMG, Brazil)

This is a version for conference presentation. Please do not quote. Comments are welcome.

To analyse circuits of intellectual exchange emphasizing the position of particular individuals in the processes of international diffusion of ideas is undoubtedly an important strategy to understand the dissemination of cameralist ideas in the world of the Enlightenment. The specificities of the Portuguese case make an investigation on the influence of Germanic ideas in Portugal during the eighteenth century particularly dependent on a broad set of individuals traditionally referred in the historiography as "estrangeirados"². The basic idea is that these individuals had directly contact with important matrices of the European cultural universe in their prolonged experiences in foreign countries and that later, after their return to Portugal, functioned as privileged vehicles in the transmission of these influences, coming to represent the outward-looking intellectuals' perspective in the Portuguese context.

The term, however, has often been used inaccurately by historiography, beginning with the difficulties related to the qualification of a group that was in fact by no means homogeneous. From individuals who had left Portugal on account of religious persecution, and others who had done so on account of

¹ I would like to thank Ere Nokkala, Nicholas Miller and Dominik Hünniger for the invitation to join the Research Network "Cameralism across the World of Enlightenment", as well as the first two, for their editorial work. I am also grateful to all the participants of the workshops for the collaborative work at the Lichtenberg-Kolleg in Göttingen. I would also like to thank Caio Boschi and José Luís Cardoso for the bibliographical references provided. Financial support from CNPq (the Brazilian National Research Council) and FAPEMIG (the Research Foundation of Minas Gerais) is gratefully acknowledged.

² The term "estrangeirado" has long been referenced in the debate about ideas within the Portuguese world. Previously used as a negative qualifier in the political debate, the term became to be used progressively by the historiography in positive terms to name individuals that had contact with the European enlightenment and were responsible for introducing them into a Portuguese context described as backward and not particularly opened, and therefore had a decisive role in this modernization animated from outside. The Portuguese historiography, nevertheless, at least since Macedo (1974), managed to progressively overcome this dichotomous perspective and to criticize the lack of analytical precision of this concept, showing a myriad of other elements related to the processes of cultural circulation, but at the same time recognizing how the "estrangeirados" actually played an important role in the dissemination of foreign ideas in Portugal in the eighteenth century, which obviously does not correspond to a model of lights illuminating the darkness, but rather to their active role in the combinations and recombination of ideas and traditions.

education, war, commerce, adventure, or state functions (as the diplomats), there are all kinds of trajectories and all sorts of characters. However, the recurrence in the Portuguese case of contexts in which is easy to identify localist perspectives versus ones influenced by foreign ideas, is one of the reasons that make this category, even if not so precise, of analytical interest. And although this dichotomy between individuals who were open or reticent to foreign ideas could also be slightly exaggerated in the specialized literature in Portugal (see: Magalhães, 2004), this category does not fail to represent a particular mechanism of influence of foreign ideas and the importance of these sources, often deliberately mixing varied sources, that was part of a progressive process of transformation in Portuguese culture at the time, with direct implications for political and economic conceptions. A prominent subset of this group of estrangeirados corresponds to men such as our main character of interest here, Rodrigo de Souza Coutinho (or his godfather, the Marquis of Pombal)³, who, after their formative experiences in foreign countries, frequently related to their positions as diplomats, would return to Portugal to perform the highest functions of the State, acting as catalysts of this process of articulation with specific lineages of European thinking, particularly those of interest to governance.

During the second half of the eighteenth century, administrative reforms created a favourable environment for the transmission of certain elements of cameralist ideas in Portugal. It is a kind of influence that takes place more in terms of practice than of theoretical speculations, but it must be clear that these are not absolutely separated poles. We speak of a practical action, or of models designed for that practical action, dedicated to the problems and ambitions of the exercise of governance but with clear connections to diverse theoretical models. The diversity of the theoretical models that informed and inspired reformist action is another important issue in the analysis of the Portuguese case. The cameralism that can be traced in Portuguese thought has never been more than one of several ingredients in a recipe of many flavours. This realization should be emphasized at the outset so that we do not present the impression that we are speaking about a direct or pure influence of Germanic cameralism on Portuguese economic and political ideas.

In previous texts, I have used the expression "quasi-cameralism"⁵ to refer to this influence in order to highlight this indirect and incomplete aspect. The expression continues to be useful to me and is equally appropriate to the present analysis, but I do not find it necessary to repeat "quasi" page after page, particularly because this is not an exclusive characteristic of the Portuguese case, pointing out to common aspects of several processes of transmission of late cameralist. It is thus interesting to note that if influence in the Portuguese case occurs in a composite picture, even with different degrees of intensity, the result of the cameralist influence that can be traced to different parts of continental

³ As Sebastião José de Carvalho e Melo, the Marquis of Pombal, is remembered as the central name of enlightened absolutism in Portugal in the mid-eighteenth century, Souza Coutinho is ordinarily referred to as the most important name of the enlightened reformism of the last years of the century (See: Maxwell 1995 and Paquette 2014).

⁴ On the problems associated with the simplistic dualism between theory and practice in the study of cameralism, see in particular Keith Tribe's "Concluding Remarks" to Seppel and Tribe's *Cameralism in practice: state administration and economy in early modern Europe* (2017).

⁵ See Cardoso & Cunha 2012 and Cunha 2017b

Europe during the eighteenth century is also a composite image, as can be found, for example, on the Italian peninsula and in France, Switzerland and Spain. It is equally true that the cameralism of the second half of the eighteenth century is already in itself, in some measure, also composite; it is a basis for ideas on which diverse influences are being betrayed.

To say that the introduction of cameralist ideas to Portugal is marked by this multifaceted and composite aspect also means that this influence can be analysed from different angles and recomposed on different fronts. There is no single influence that produces a single result here; instead, several sources are combined and recombined. I have explored different dimensions of these processes in other papers by studying specific dimensions of the dissemination of cameralist knowledge, regarding for example the Policeywissenschaft (police science), the centralization of public finances, translations/adaptations and the circulation of books, as well as focusing on specific individuals as particularly relevant to these transmissions processes. This chapter will highlight the trajectory of one of those important individuals as a way to insist on one of these multiple paths of transmission. The main topic here is the importance of Portuguese diplomatic relations as a specific channel for the dissemination of cameralist ideas and the case to be explored is the work of a particular diplomat and minister, Rodrigo de Souza Coutinho, as a central name to understand the connection between cameralism and enlightened reformism in Portugal.

Using elements of the trajectory of Souza Coutinho as a privileged source for charting different circuits of intellectual exchange, we can put the enlightened reformism at the centre of our analysis and reinforce a perspective of the instrumentalization of cameralist knowledge as an ingredient of reformist practices in the eighteenth century. It also reinforces a reading of "late" cameralism, which results from systematizing exercises that have developed since the middle of the eighteenth century, particularly in the works of authors such as Johann Heinrich Gottlob von Justi, and form a literature that is also close to other continental sources. Therefore, permeable and articulate to much of the reflection on society, economy and politics that took place in distinct parts of Europe under the diffuse but far-reaching influence of the Enlightenment. It is by thinking in this way, in terms of a cameralism that can also be read as part of a "science of the ruler or legislator," that we believe that the specific reflection on dissemination in the Portuguese case also helps illuminate important aspects of the specific place occupied by the cameral sciences (Cameralwissenschaften) in the second half of the eighteenth century, as well as the challenges of studying the international dissemination of political and economic ideas in the period in question.

This chapter is divided into five parts comprising, first, this introduction. Parts 2, 3 and 4, deals with issues related to the transmission of these ideas in direct association with the diplomatic trajectory of the influential this minister, Rodrigo de Souza Coutinho: first detailing his diplomatic experience as Portuguese plenipotentiary minister to the Kingdom of Sardinia for almost two decades, then presenting his reflections on poverty and begging as directed influenced by some cameralist sources and finally exploring different examples of his interests as diplomat that have connections with cameralist perspectives, from ideas to legal and legislative system to the importation of models for machines for various arts and manufactures. Lastly, section 5, presents some final considerations in an attempt to qualify this particular example in the

broader terms of a complex transmission process of this German matrix of ideas in the confines of Europe during the eighteenth century.

2. Souza Coutinho's diplomatic experience and the place of cameralist elements in enlightened reformist discourse

At first, it may seem a bit strange (some would even say contradictory) to consider the influences of cameralist ideas on Rodrigo de Souza Coutinho, the Count de Linhares, who is often remembered as being responsible for one of the first internalizations of the Smithian discourse in Portugal and for giving voice to some of Smith's ideas as justification for the reformist action within the Portuguese government at the end of the eighteenth century, in a perspective close to what Gaspar Melchor de Jovellanos expressed in Spain, for example. There is, however, no contradiction in this intersection of discourses. Since the reading of the composite presence of certain elements of cameralist discourse in Portuguese enlightened reformism is the main purpose of the present chapter, Souza Coutinho's experience is undoubtedly one of the best sources for our analysis.

Souza Coutinho is an example of a thinker and statesman who absorbed various influences in order to guide his reflection and action on economic governing. His direct and extensive contact with the Italian intellectual environment and with Italian politics of the second half of the eighteenth century was crucial for this. The Portuguese diplomat would have had first-hand contact with the Italian enlightened environment, for which economic reflection occupied a central and prominent place in the ideas of authors such as Galiani, Genovesi, Filangieri, Dragonetti, Beccaria or Verri.⁶ Souza Coutinho spent almost twenty years at the court of Turin beginning in 1779, when he presented his credentials to King Victor Amadeus III as extraordinary envoy and plenipotentiary minister to the Kingdom of Sardinia, and ending in 1796, when he returned to Lisbon to assume the position of State Secretary of the Navy and Ultramarine Domains, as well as, just after, the presidency of the Royal Treasury and the command of the State Secretariat of Finance. Born in 1755, Souza Coutinho, who was the godson of Sebastião José de Carvalho e Melo, the all-powerful Marquis of Pombal, studied at the Royal College of Nobles (created by Pombal under the inspiration of the Theresianum in Vienna) and at the newly reformed University of Coimbra, institutions in which he was influenced by two Italian professors with whom he would keep in touch throughout his life, the mathematician Michele Franzini and the naturalist and chemist Domenico Vandelli, who was part of Linnaeus' network of correspondents and a key figure in the dissemination of scientific knowledge focused on the practical implementation and progress of economic activities in Portugal. At the age of only 23, and before completing his academic training, under the influence of his father Francisco Inocêncio de Souza Coutinho, then ambassador of Portugal to the Spanish court, he obtained in 1778 an appointment

Zamagni (1993), the period 1751–1790 can be remembered as the *âge d'or* of Italian economic thought, being the economic ideas a central and favorite subject for the Enlightenment in Italy.

⁶ As defined by Georges-Henri Bousquet (1960) and endorsed by Ernesto Screpanti and Stefano

as extraordinary envoy to and minister plenipotentiary in the Kingdom of Sardinia (which included the Duchy of Savoy and the Principality of Piedmont).

During the eighteenth century, from the reforms carried out by Victor Amadeus II, Duke of the House of Savoy, and continued in part by his successor Charles Emmanuel III, Piedmont began to arouse the political and diplomatic attention of the European states. Understanding this experience was the focus of Souza Coutinho's attention and a decisive influence on his ideas. The Piedmont reforms are the subject of various historiographical disputes regarding their degree of connection to the Enlightenment and to so-called enlightened despotism. It seems essential here to highlight the content of this early reformist action driven by the House of Savoy, which included substantive transformations of the state, the reduction of feudal and ecclesiastical autonomy, and reforms at the central and local government levels, including finance, the codification of laws and the transformation of cultural, educational and intellectual institutions, such as the University of Turin, as well as important advances in the fight against poverty and begging. Souza Coutinho would carefully analyse the characteristics and significance of these reforms, which are always mentioned in the documents sent by him to Lisbon. One good example is his memoir, written in French, on the reforms within the magistracy and the legal field: Essai sur la magistrature (Mansuy-Diniz Silva, 2002: 158 and Souza Coutinho, 1993: 38-46 and 192-201). The focus of the historiographical disputes concerns, nevertheless, the fact that these reforms took place in 1690-1713 and 1748 and therefore before the period commonly understood as the era of Enlightened Despotism. The second half of the eighteenth century in Piedmont is hardly remembered within the literature in terms of any reform influenced by the Enlightenment, which is in sharp contrast to what occurred in neighbouring states such as the Grand Duchy of Tuscany under Leopold of Austria, the Duchy of Milan under Maria Theresia and Joseph II. and the Kingdom of Naples under Carlo di Borbone and his successors.

In line with the analysis by Christopher Storrs (2009), it does not seem appropriate to deny that the Savoyard state was part of the group of reformist states in the second half of the eighteenth century. It is interesting to note that, although lacking a local intelligentsia, such as those that would take shape in Naples and Milan, it is possible to identify a specific process, essentially connected to the level of the direct action of ministers of state, such as the Secretary of War of Emmanuel III, Count Giovanni Battista Bogino di Migliandolo, for whom the model of transformation of the state approached the perspective of the good government of Muratori's *pubblica felicita*. The type of combination of perspectives present there, comprising the perspective of public happiness and the models of "good government" that are also articulated in cameralist perspectives, seems to us to be effectively close to the composite picture that, as we are insisting here, influenced not only the Portuguese case but also much of the process of transformation of the political and economic ideas applied to the administration of different European states in the period.

The nature of the reformist process in Piedmont throughout the eighteenth century still holds another point of interest that concerns precisely the prospects of the combination of reforms with the unequivocal preservation of the centrality

⁷ A good example of this is the Italian translation of the first part of Sonnenfels' *Grundsätze der Polizey, Handlung und Finanzwissenshften* (1765), which was published under the title *La scienza del buon governo* (1784) [The science of good government].

of the power of the sovereign, which certainly must have been of interest to Souza Coutinho, who, years later, would assert in his official correspondence that "no one is more passionate than I am about a luminous despotism, in which the interest of the despot and that of the nation is inseparable," and insist on how, first of all, "the interest of a wise and skilful despot is actually inseparable from that of the people."

The small Savoyard State effectively gained a place and seat in international debates at the beginning of the eighteenth century, which greatly increased the number of foreign diplomats residing in Turin throughout the century, as well as that of Sardinian ministers in other European courts (Storrs, 2015: 215-6). Contact with diplomats from various states, including England, France, Prussia, Russia, Saxony, Spain, as well as the neighbouring states of the Italian peninsula, were an essential part of the sociability and intense exchange of information established by Souza Coutinho in Turin (Mansuy-Diniz Silva, 2002: 183-204). Furthermore, the city of Turin enjoyed an expressive cultural vitality at that time, with an increasing number of bookstores that benefited from the fact that the city was an important starting point for distribution throughout Italy of works published by Swiss editors in Geneva, Lausanne, Neuchâtel and Yverdon, editors who were instrumental in the diffusion of Enlightenment texts (Storrs, 2009: 209; Darnton, 1979).

At a time when the Piedmont reforms were already well-known in terms of their content and effects and the present state of institutions and administrations elicited criticism and drew attention to the contrast with the reforms that were occurring in neighbouring states in the Italian peninsula, the Grand Duchy of Tuscany (whose experience under the command of Emperor Leopold was widely disseminated with the 1790 publication of *Governo della Toscana sotto il regno di sua Maestà il Rè Leopoldo II*) aroused the close attention of Souza Coutinho.⁹ His observation would recurrently appear in the pages of his weekly correspondence with the central administration in Lisbon.

In the diligent exercise of his diplomatic duties, Souza Coutinho produced various organized reflections on economic, political, and administrative issues of interest to the Portuguese state, including a wide range of topics, such as army organization, ecclesiastical reforms, the free trade of grain, the problem of poverty and the control of begging, the balance of power between nations and the immediate problems of the international order, among many others. From these detailed reflections filtered in his readings and in his conviviality with the Italian intellectual environment of that time, which captured questions inspired by the examples of other nations and benefited directly from different intellectual sources, we can highlight one topic that occupied his weekly correspondence with the Secretariat of Foreign Affairs in Lisbon for more careful analysis. His arguments regarding the problem of begging are a good example of how some diffuse cameral elements are mixed with other discursive structures. What is of great interest is to note a cameralist perspective within the context in which

⁸ See Santos 2009 and Mansuy-Diniz Silva 1991.

⁹ In one of the references that Souza Coutinho made to the importance of Leopold II and the book *Governo della Toscana sotto il regno di sua Maestà il Rè Leopoldo II*, he says that this "is a prodigy of reason, and whose effects in that country were such as to exceed all expectation" (Private Correspondence of Souza Coutinho with his brother José Antonio, Turin, January 29, 1794 apud Mansuy-Diniz Silva, 2002: 616).

political economy was taking shape as autonomous knowledge, combining the dimension of a market science with its real primordial function at that time as a science of the legislator interested in accompanying the various areas of governance.¹⁰

3. Souza Coutinho's reflections on poverty and mendicancy and his cameralist sources

An important source for thinking about state management models in order to respond to social and economic problems is the Discurso sobre a Mendicidade ["Discourse on Mendicity"], which was written by Souza Coutinho between 1787 and 1788. The *Discurso* presents a reflection on the origins and causes of begging and proposes political measures aimed at reducing the burden of idle classes on society. This text is a long-meditated reflection (the first mention of the subject in his weekly correspondence dates to 178311) solidly supported by examples and the European debate on the subject. This *Discurso* is often remembered as evidence of Souza Coutinho's connection to Adam Smith's ideas, in particular because of the explicit references to *The Wealth of Nations* at the very opening of the text, where Souza Coutinho speaks of the "undoubted principle in political economy that the wealth of a nation is proportional to the quantity or sum of his annual work," 12 and subsequently presents specific Smithian notions on the division of labour and accumulation of capital. Nonetheless, there is also evidence in this extensive discourse of an interplay with other sources, including with cameralist ideas and practices; this connection has tended to go unnoticed by analysts of Souza Coutinho's works.

What Smith offers (and to some extent is a point of arrival for reflections on a self-regulated order that can be read within the broad frame of evolution of the debates in the field of the philosophy of natural law interpreting the foundations of social and economic organization ¹³) is fundamentally a comprehensive explanation of the nature, evolution, and functioning of the commercial society that places the issue of division of labour at the centre of the analysis and as such articulates the question of the satisfaction of self-interest with the promotion of spontaneous social harmony. Souza Coutinho seems to grasp at least the essential of this perspective and this serves as a starting point for him to reflect how idleness represents also a serious economic problem. The recipe for overcoming this problem had police matters as a central focus and this, in particular to the Portuguese context of the second half of the eighteenth century represented a centralized vision of the state, with the legislative action emanating from the direct will of the sovereign. And the importance of the police matters in

 $^{^{10}}$ On the emergence and development of political economy in the Age of Enlightenment see Cardoso 2015 and 2018.

¹¹ See Mansuy-Diniz Silva, 2002: 163.

¹² The famous first sentence of the *Wealth of Nations'* introduction is "The annual labour of every nation is the fund which originally supplies it with all the necessaries and conveniences of life which it annually consumes, and which consist always either in the immediate produce of that labour, or in what is purchased with that produce from other nations" (Smith, 1904 [1776]: 1).

legal documents emanating directly from the king-legislator suggest interesting connections with the cameralist practice and discourse.

The inspiration for analysing the origins of the problem and for proposing measures to combat begging seems to have arisen from diverse sources, which leave their mark on the text and include a broad record of the science of government administration, police and the common good that can also be traced to Souza Coutinho's extensive personal library, 14 for example Von Justi, Bielfeld, Filangieri, and De Réal, among others. In particular, we can highlight the influence of Giovanni Battista Vasco and the ideas of his exiled fellow-countryman, António Ribeiro Sanches, as well as certain French perspectives, such as those of Turgot or Necker. All of this, as we have noted, in addition to the powerful influence of Smith's ideas, offers key aspects in the organization of the argumentative line of Souza Coutinho's discourse. All of this is indeed present, without requiring a misrepresentation of these various arguments in order to combine them. This obviously does not mean that political arithmetic, cameralism, Physiocracy, Scottish enlightenment, and other sources all mean the same thing or point to the same questions and prescriptions, but rather that there was enough plasticity in these ideas at the end of the eighteenth century to make that combination possible with a view to guiding governmental action and underpinning the political, reformist and illustrated reflections of Souza Coutinho.

Souza Coutinho's *Discurso* is a long and flowing text that initially presents the problem, investigates its causes and identifies three factors that give rise to it: "nature," "religion" and "society." ¹⁵ He recognizes, for example, the inevitable natural causes of idleness, related to health or age but confronts the other causes. In relation to religion, he first emphasizes the problems arising from the non-productive condition of the high number of religieux, the excessive hours dedicated to worship, and the many holidays that equally diminish work. He also points to the habit of giving alms indiscriminately, "confusing the true poor with the idle." Then, confronting the social causes, he mentions the problem of the "false principles of legislation and administration" and the unproductiveness inherent

1

¹⁴ The manuscript with the complete listing of the books of the personal library of Souza Coutinho can be found at the Portuguese National Archives (Arquivo Nacional Torre do Tombo, *Fundo Condes de Linhares*: Livro 4. The manuscript can also be reached online at: http://digitarq.arquivos.pt/details?id=4727614). Two recent explorations about the meaning of this collection are: Carolino 2013 and Cardoso 2018.

¹⁵ This presentation of the problem has an interesting connection with a work on mendicancy written by Giambatista Vasco (frequently refereed in the literature as "Beccaria" of Piedmont), in which he enumerates in the same manner as Souza Coutinho, three causes for the problem ("need", "laziness" and "the advantages of the 'profession' of beggar"). Vasco's Mémoire sur les causes de la mendicité et sur les moyens de la supprimer, was published in 1790, but as the author explains in the introduction, the memoir was originally written in 1778 for a contest that ended up not being realized in Paris and was then kept until 1788 (the same time as Souza Coutinho was writing his Discurso), when he finally submitted it to another contest on the causes and solutions for the problem of mendicity, opened by the Academic and Patriotic Society of Valence in Dauphiné, which earned him an honorable mention. There are not many references in this respect, but it is a fact that Vasco and Souza Coutinho had a personal relationship. In particular, it is possible to mention a reference to a dinner at the residence of Souza Coutinho, narrated by Arthur Young (1793: 553-4), a major English eighteenth century writer on agriculture and responsible for the publication in English of a memoir of Souza Coutinho on agriculture, with the presence of the chemist Costanzo Benedetto Bonvicino, the respected botanist Carlo Ludovico Bellardi and the Dominican Giovanni Battista Vasco. It is no exaggeration to suppose that Souza Coutinho, who endeavored to gather all possible sources on the subject of mendicity, should know beforehand Vasco's memoir.

in the class of the "necessary but excessive" public officials, among others (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 205-6). The discourse goes on to provide a very informed exposition of examples of how "ancient and modern governments" attacked these problems and finally outlines an extensive plan of political, economic, fiscal, religious, and social reforms that far surpass the problem of begging, aiming rather at eliciting profound changes in the internal administration of the kingdom.

Regarding the cameralist elements present in *Discurso*, we can point out the presence of a set of ideas easily associated with Justi's perspective on police, whose Die Grundsätze der Polizeiwissenschaft (1756) was a familiar text to Souza Coutinho and was in his library in its French version (Eléments généraux de police, from 1769). However, concern with the issue of poverty and begging can be traced very broadly in European debates of the eighteenth century, and since this was a key issue related to the role of the police, it was extensively discussed in the French tradition, as well as in the *Policeywissenschaft* literature. In addition to the specificities, including the reciprocal crossings of these traditions that we have previously discussed in other texts 16, it is interesting to argue here that the reflections about begging repeat each other to exhaustion, requiring special attention to verify specifically what is new in either argument or what is new in the specific arrangement of ideas. Moreover, it is also important to insist that the German tradition of police science can be singled out in comparison with the French one because of its search for a more systematic treatment of topics, with particular attention to the economic dynamics, as in the case of the analysis of poverty and begging in Justi's work, which resembles the concerns that Souza Coutinho develops in his discourse.

These issues appear in Justi's work in direct connection with his view of happiness (*Glückseligkeit*), which in turn concerns not the idea of individual happiness, but more properly the idea of the common happiness (*gemeinschaftliche Glückseligkeit*) of the state and its subjects, pointing to a set of themes that can be approximated to a notion of "social welfare," in which his reflections on poverty, health, hunger and begging stand out.

The happiness of the state increases with the number of healthy people who live in that state, and it decreases with the increase in the number of sick people, very old people, or those living in extreme poverty. As Ursula Backhaus (2008: 177) insists (perhaps too incisively, but still pointing to important questions), at that time, there were no fundamental preconditions in terms of institutions and economic organization for the formation of a modern politics of state health, but Justi's outlook points precisely in the direction of formulating preconditions for both within a systemic perspective on problems with a view to promoting collective happiness.

Justi took steps in this direction, for example, by focusing on the problem of hunger within a direct logic of improving and increasing the population and in view of the need to improve economic organization and the design of specific institutions, insisting on measures such as controls to improve the quality of health care, hygienic measures to prevent epidemics, and institutions so that people could save for personal difficulties, among others (Backhaus, 2008: 177).

These reflections are dispersed throughout his works, in particular those dealing with the police. As for "how to prevent hunger," the direct connection is

_

¹⁶ See Cunha 2010 and 2017a.

with incentives and encouragement to cultivate land and agriculture, including property structure, fiscal issues, and even (if the desired result is not achieved by increasing taxes) that "the government is authorized to declare by law that it must cultivate its acreage within a few years, or that its property should be declared lost as a result of it."¹⁷

More or less coincident perspectives appear in the reflection on the theme proposed by Jacob Friedrich von Bielfeld in his Institutions politiques (1760). Bielfeld's book was widely disseminated, being an important source in the diffusion of cameralist ideas beyond the Germanic world, even that also including other analytical perspectives. In the Luso-Brazilian world, Bielfeld's reflections were adapted and repeated by several authors (either crediting the source or not¹⁸), and the book was easily found in the libraries of several important state ministers interested in the debates on economic governing, from Pombal to Souza Coutinho. Bielfeld discusses various aspects of the mendicity problem in his book, including reflections that Souza Coutinho should have been interested in, such as the abuses concerning countless convents and other religious establishments that albeit serve the purpose of combating poverty, also subtracted from society's workforce as a number of healthy believers under the "pretext of religion" ceased to engage in productive activities (Bielfeld, 1760: 66). Another point of contact is Bielfeld's marked differentiation between true poverty and "vagabond begging," which must be fought by means of appropriate police ordinances. The question of workhouses is also the subject of their reflections and is presented as an important strategy to solve the problem (Bielfeld, 1760: 66-7).

These are examples of cameralist perspectives that certainly reached Souza Coutinho's reflections on begging. Since the Portuguese diplomat was interested not only in presenting solutions to problems but also in reflecting about the situation from a systemic perspective, the police science standpoint (with its connections with the problems of poverty, begging and broader issues concerning the economic dynamics and the internal administration of the state with police matters) was certainly of great interest to him. This interest in finding a systematic perspective to these problems places Souza Coutinho in the position of being a receiver of a vast set of questions that included cameralist police science as well as several other possible sources for reformist enlightened reflection, all of them well connected in this particular context with the specific conceptions of wealth and accumulation assimilated in the readings of Smith's work.

In the section devoted to the actions undertaken by ancient and modern governments, we can see Souza Coutinho attempting to gather an expressive number of examples and to make explicit his logics of functioning. This quest for concrete examples involved the consultation of many books as mentioned by him, such as *De l'administration des finances de la France* (1784) by Jacques Necker,

¹⁷ See Justi, 1761/4: 618-9 and Backhaus, 2008: 178.

¹⁸ Among the several Portuguese-Brazilian authors who read and quoted Bielfeld's works we can mention the economic works of José Joaquim da Cunha de Azeredo Coutinho (written mainly between 1794 and 1804), José Bonifácio de Andrada and an interesting anonymous work, published in 1823 with a "summary of the political institutions of the Baron of Bielfeld," offering it to "the youth of Brazil" (*Resumo das instituições políticas do Barão de Bielfeld, parafraseadas e acomodadas à forma actual do governo do Império do Brasil, oferecido à mocidade brasiliense por um seu compatriota pernambucano*). The actual author of this anonymous work is Bernardo José da Gama (and not Gervásio Pires Ferreira, as we affirmed in a previous article: Cardoso & Cunha 2012).

with its discussion of the "dépôts de mendicité" (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 213-4). However, Souza Coutinho also sought to establish direct contact with important authors of his day in order to obtain detailed information on the topic. For example, his contact with the well-known geographer, statistician, and Göttingen professor, Anton Friedrich Büsching. We do not know how this contact began, but there is much evidence of their correspondence and exchanges of favours in the form of books sent to each other. Büsching is the source mentioned by Souza Coutinho for the treatment given to these questions in Prussia, allowing a detailed understanding of the plan designed to combat begging in Berlin, which he praises so much in his work (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 217). At the request of Souza Coutinho, Büsching sought detailed information on the most current picture of the situation in the German context, finally presenting the Portuguese diplomat with Plan zur bessern Einrichtung der Armenkasse und der Verteilung der Almosen in Berlin (1787) by Thomas Philipp von der Hagen, an important player in the (President administration Prussian of the Oberkonsistorium, Armendirektoriums and the Kurmärkische Amts-Kirchen-Revenuen-Direktorium, as well as head of the *Obercollegium Medicum*).

Büsching was lavish in praising the concern and patriotism of Souza Coutinho's initiative and understood that the subject deserved to be spread by him in 1787 in his periodical (*Wöchentliche Nachrichten von neuen Landcharten und geographischen, statistischen und historischen Büchern und Schriften,* 1773-1787) and in a new edition of his *Magazin für die neue Historie und Geographie* (1787), mentioning in both the request originally received from the Portuguese minister. Alongside the *Discurso*, Souza Coutinho also sent to Lisbon translations of relevant parts of various works on the subject, which included pages from the "geographical magazine of Büsching" (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 217). Providing translations of relevant documents or publications was current practice for these diplomats and a fundamental channel for the entry of certain ideas into the Portuguese government. It is difficult to think of another location in which these contacts with ideas from diverse nations obtained such a direct and rapid route of transmission, although always marked by specific interests and, as a rule, in a fragmented or decontextualized way.²⁰

The example of Prussia was highlighted and praised by Souza Coutinho, in particular because of the institutions created and policies adopted. He also added that in Prussia, the causes of begging "derived from society or legislation", are "less frequent than in any other part thanks to Frederick II's new code, and above all to

_

¹⁹ Büsching mentions in the preface of his *Magazin* that Souza Coutinho, "who is very attentive to all good facilities, constitutions, institutions, and proposals that are of common use, and who is a genuine patriot for his country" had sent to him a letter in which he once again asked him all the printed news related to the question and specifically the Prussian plan. (Büsching, 1787: "Vorred", n. pag.)

²⁰ There are many the examples of this type of transmission via translations among the manuscripts of the State Secretariat of Foreign Affairs at Portugal National Archives. One important function of the diplomatic legations in foreign lands was to provide translations of important documents. And in countries where difficult languages such as German, Swedish or Russian were spoken, translations were crucial, particularly into French, the lingua franca of the enlightened world, but also into Italian or Spanish, depending on the availability of translators. An example, among many others is the "instruction for the new general controller of finance", translated from German into French (Arquivo Nacional Torre do Tombo, *Ministério dos Negócios Estrangeiros*: Berlin, cx. 819).

the simplification of procedure which he introduced in the courts", and that the causes "derived from religion" have "absolutely no effect whatsoever, since the number of the ministers is the most limited, the worship is the simplest, there are no ecclesiastical communities, no brotherhoods, no confraternities, and the use of processions has been abolished since the time of the Reformation" (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 217). Another interesting example of a Germanic model praised by Souza Coutinho is the case of Austria, which as a Catholic nation was closer to the Portuguese context. He informed about the original documents that were sent to Lisbon accompanying the discourse (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 211), highlighting the example of the various institutions, including the severe and correctional workhouses, that are presented by him as a result of an active police with a view to promoting "universal prosperity", with particular attention being paid to measures taken to reform the causes of poverty originating from the religion, which included the reduction of the number of convents, the extinction of contemplative orders and brotherhoods or confraternities.

However, it is the final part of the *Discurso*, where Souza Coutinho presents his plan for the solution to the problem in Portugal, that perhaps holds the more interesting aspects for a reflection on the influence of cameralist models, practices and ideas. Even if essentially unrealistic, given the breadth of the proposed reform, the proposition to solve the origins of begging "derived by society," directly addressing the problem of the large number of civil servants without much use, from inferior judges to higher courts, leads to a proposal to reorganize the internal administration of the country. After references to reforms to the legal system, ecclesiastical organization, fiscal organization and the dynamics of public credit, among others (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 220-2), there is a long exposition of the principles of a complete reform of the internal administration of the kingdom by means of the revocation of the "forais" (the medieval royal charter defining town privileges). This passage also addresses the structure of the current local administration and proposes a model in which, at the parish, provincial and national levels, councils would be created and subdivided into three bodies dedicated to political affairs, charity and police. All issues pertaining to the state's internal administration would be dealt with by these bodies, with particular emphasis on police functions, which should include, for example, the elaboration of demographic, geographic and cartographic information with implications for the tax authorities, among others. Souza Coutinho describes with propriety the organization that should be given to this collection of population information, which should include "daily records of marriages, births and deaths, specifying ages, cause of death, etc., in order to form a table to be submitted monthly to the general council of the parish and then addressed at the provincial level" (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 226). All resolutions at the parish and provincial levels would be presented to a National Council comprising representatives of the provincial councils and a chosen number of individuals appointed by the sovereign, including nobles, magistrates, chief ministers of state, and "mathematicians, chemists, physicists, and engineers," who would decide on the primary aspects of internal administration, including the inspection of all the kingdom's agriculture and industry (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 230). It is clear to see in these descriptions some variations on the cameralist mould for the structuring of public administration in Prussia, where the three council levels proposed for Portugal correspond to the Prussian levels of parochial *kammer*, provincial *kammer* and General Directory.

However, the indelible mark of enlightened reformism, which proposed changes that, although profound, should never threaten the traditional order of the ancient regime (the source of the power of the sovereign in itself), is nevertheless presented at the end of the document. The proposed plan, based on the most "luminous principles of administration known today," would serve to remedy the problem of begging (and others) and to simplify the economic administration of the kingdom but "without being at odds with the constitution of a monarchical state" (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 232).

It is easy to see in this eighteenth-century perspective the treatment of the problem of mendicancy and vagrancy a biopolitical dimension of state surveillance, in line with Michel Foucault's analyses, for whom the workhouses functioned as instruments for an emphasis on work as an aspect of the system of control that emerges in Western capitalist society.²¹

But while it is interesting to aggregate, as Foucault, the experiences of the various European countries in a coincident sense, it is at the same time necessary to carefully understand in separate the meaning and practical reality of these institutions in different countries. It is interesting to note that in the arguments and examples analysed by Souza Coutinho in the *Discurso*, a critical perspective is reserved to the French context, insisting that "in France is more appreciable what is written and proposed by the great authors of political economy of that nation, than all that is implemented". Souza Coutinho welcomes Necker's attempts at reform of hospitals and correctional houses as a way of correcting the problem of a structure that for him was conceived much more for "remedying the consequences rather than destroying evil" (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 212). This serves within the *Discurso* as a reinforcement of Souza Coutinho's analysis of the origins of mendicancy associated with errors in legislation and administration.

It is in particular with regard to the causes that Souza Coutinho associates with "society", and that demand reforms of these administrative and legislative level as well as on fiscal structures and on the public spending that we perceive a concern that tends to control the number and the size of institutions such as workhouses and "dépôts de mendicité", rather than to augment them, as in the French example. There is a clear ambition in Souza Coutinho's text that, by attacking the causes pointed out by him (from "nature," "religion" and "society"), the problem could be in fact controlled and reduced, which allows him to plan a system in which these necessary institutions - "for the relief of the miserable needy and to prevent idleness and the maintenance of the vagabonds that infest society" (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 222) - could be created and administered at the parish, provincial, and national levels, as mentioned above. There is, however, this explicit reinforcement to the centrality of the monarchical power that manifests itself directly in this analysis of the "society" causes of mendicancy when translating into an administrative and legal reorganization a concern with the increase of the social control of the whole of the population, which pervades both the institutions designed to tackle the problem of poverty, mendicancy and vagrancy, but also the councils responsible for inspecting these institutions and at the same time taking care of so many aspects of internal administration that permeate the population as a whole.

-

²¹ See Foucault 2009 and 2010.

4. Gathering knowledge and searching for models: from legal and legislative systems to machines for various arts and manufactures

Several other examples can be gathered in Souza Coutinho's trajectory in order to reflect on the influence of these cameralist elements in the enlightened reformist perspectives. Valuable sources for this are the annual compilations of diplomatic letters and documents organized by him in Turin. As a diligent diplomat and in an attempt of increasing his influence on the central administration in Lisbon, Souza Coutinho began in 1783 to organize annual compilations of the main topics of all his weekly correspondence with Lisbon, systematizing the subjects, including additional observations and sending more supporting documents. There are several examples here of connections with cameralist topics. The compilation of 1787 is particularly interesting in this sense. There are, among other subjects, reflections on reforms in the legal and legislative system, on police matters (including demographic issues) and on public finances. Regarding the reflection on the jurisprudence, Souza Coutinho analyses the evolution of civil and criminal legislation in Piedmont since the reforms of the beginning of the century made by "the great Victor Amadeus II, who left in all branches of government brilliant evidence of his immortal geniality, not forgotten matters of legislation, public education or police" (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 41), and being followed on this by the his successors responsible for showing the "happy consequences that the lights of political economy let them already foresee" (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 44). A close look at what happened in neighbouring states in the Italian peninsula is evident, for example in his reflection on the importance of proportionality between crimes and punishments in criminal matters, in direct connection to Beccaria's very influential perspective, in which he praised the example of the Grand Duchy of Tuscany (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 44). With regard to the themes of poverty and begging, here again the merits of the Piedmont experience are pointed out, but also highlighting examples of different other nations, highlighting the topic of the workhouses and mentioning that he was working on a specific memoir on the subject that would send soon to Lisbon: the Discurso analysed above (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 46).

The comparison between the positive results of the reforms of the beginning of the century and the recent difficulties of the kingdom would not go unnoticed. In presenting a detailed description of the individuals occupying the main functions at the Savoyard State administration, he shows a strong criticism in particular for the conducting of the finance administration, headed by Count Corte, the Secretary of State for Internal Affairs and president of the *Camera dei Conti*. Carlo Giuseppe Ignazio Maria Corte, former professor of *jus civile* at the University di Torino, is criticized by Souza Coutinho in particular because of his lack the necessary knowledge of finance administration and political economy, essential for the function: "he despises all study that is not his Roman law, naming the modern works of political economy, of which he might probably not understand, with the ridiculous epithet of *brochures*. It is easy to see the little that can be expected from a minister so hypocritical and so ignorant in matters so important for his functions" (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 51). Police matters deserve also close attention from the Portuguese minister, in particular regarding the

elaboration of population lists (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 86). The subject of the improvement of the demographic knowledge would be a constant presence Souza Coutinho's correspondence. Years later, in a letter of the beginning of 1795, few months before his return to Lisbon to assume the position of State Secretary of the Navy and Ultramarine Domains, he continued to send examples of the population charts published in Turin, commenting on what can be deduced from the analysis of these instruments and insisting that "these and other observations prove well the usefulness of these charts when they are extend to the whole State instead of being restricted only to the Capital, and how one can make with these charts a thousand of useful reflections on the means of increasing the Sovereign's Greatness, and Public Prosperity."22 These perspectives are a good representation of the importance for the enlightened reformism of a political arithmetic reasoning, connecting police, statistics and demography, learned by Souza Coutinho in different sources, including also some cameralist one, such as Justi, Bielfeld, and Süssmilch. He gives sequence to his considerations on police matters in the compilation of 1787, making comments on the importance of the different establishments that should be headed by the Police Lieutenancy such as "houses of correction and work" and the ones related to the maintenance of "widows and maidens," making comments on the models adopted in Prussia (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 59-60).

Souza Coutinho's experience as a diplomat at the Savoyard state not only gave him the opportunity for searching answers and models for the challenges of the state administration, which would include cameralist ideas and practices, but also made him an important piece in the amplification of the connections between the Germanic ideas and the Portuguese administration in general. This is true for the number examples and descriptions of institutions and administrative practices that he sent throughout the years to Lisbon, but also to his interest on more technical issues, with important implications for the Portuguese economy. He organizes, for example, in the compilation of 1787, a set of reflection and supporting documents on topics such as mining and coinage, discussing the difficulties faced by the Mint of Turin that could serve to think also some of the Portuguese challenges in this field. Discussing the technical problems related to the separation of ashes and slag from the residues of precious metal, he quotes, for example, the initiatives developed by Esprit-Benoit Nicolis de Robilant, member of the Turin Academy of Sciences, and others advances in mineralogy and metallurgy. He also makes reference to the "new method and new machines created in Hungary by Monsieur Born", and the importance of promoting mineralogical and metallurgical journeys to acquire updated knowledge on those topics. Souza Coutinho was certainly talking about the mineralogist Ignaz Edler von Born, important name of the *Bergakademie* of Schemnitz, the strategic mining school established in the Habsburg domains in Hungary (central Slovakia at present-day).²³ One of the sources of these observations was a close friend of Souza Coutinho in Turin, Carlo Antonio Napione (the "Chevalier Napion"), who is mentioned in the compilation as at the beginning of a long journey of mineralogical studies in northern Europe, paid by the Savoyard state (Souza

_

²² Diplomatic Correspondence, January 3, 1795 (Arquivo Nacional Torre do Tombo, *Ministério dos Negócios Estrangeiros*: Turin, cx. 868).

 $^{^{\}rm 23}$ Schemnitz in German or Selmécbánya in Hungarian, currently corresponds to the city of Banská Štiavnica, in Slovakia.

Coutinho, 1993: 61-2). Napione's travels would extend from 1787 to 1790 and span several destinations, including Vienna, distinct parts of Hungary (Transylvania, Banat and the North of the country), Bohemia, Freiberg, Dresden, Harz, Copenhagen, Sweden, and Britain. The main destination was the famous Bergakademie of Freiberg, whose connection with cameralist ideas and teachings was explored in detail by Wakefield (2009).²⁴ This would inspire Souza Coutinho to emphatically propose this type travels to the central administration in Lisbon, which finally resulted in sending in 1790, by order of the State Secretary of Foreign Affairs, Luís Pinto de Souza Coutinho, three newly graduated students at the University of Coimbra, for a long mineralogical journey almost with the same destinations travelled by Napione. The place where Manuel Ferreira da Câmara, José Bonifácio de Andrada and Joaquim Pedro Fragoso stayed longer was also Freiberg, where they took the full course of geognosy (historical geology) and oryctognosy (descriptive mineralogy) taught by Abraham Gottlob Werner at the Bergakademie, whose teachings strongly influenced their careers. Beyond the direct contact with advanced studies in mineralogy and mining, it was also at the Bergakademie that the Portuguese students had an important contact with ideas on the administration of state affairs in the mining activities and an overview of the pertinent cameralist doctrine.

Still in the compilation of 1787, Souza Coutinho reflects on the importance of foreign examples in promoting specific legislation on forestry and the connection of this with the sustaining of the mining activities, which is also an important topic of the cameralist literature. An extensive list of documents sent to Lisbon is added at the end of the compilation, with more than thirty models and descriptions, including "model of fortification, artillery, and military machines; drawings, memories and instruments for coinage, mineralogy and metallurgy; models on hydraulics, watering, navigation channels and sluices; as well as machines for various arts and manufactures", collected by Souza Coutinho from various parts of Europe, particularly from Saxony, Hungary and Sweden (Souza Coutinho, 1993: 91- 3).

The connections with naturalists and men of science were an object of the greater interest for Souza Coutinho, who tried insistently during his time in Turin to put some of these men in the service of the Portuguese Kingdom, including his friends Carlo Antonio Napione and Costanzo Benedetto Bonvicino. This ended up actually happening years later in the case of Napione, who after the conquest of Italy by Napoleon Bonaparte, went to Portugal in 1800, collaborating with José Bonifácio de Andrada e Silva, then intendant general of the Mines and Metals of the Kingdom, and assuming important functions in the military field aiming at the reorganization the artillery of the Portuguese Army, the production of gunpowder.

But it would be the two native Brazilians students sent in 1790 to a mineralogical journey by the Portuguese government, Câmara and Bonifácio de Andrada, who would become some of Souza Coutinho's most direct collaborators

²⁴ Napione spent several months in Freiberg in 1788 and attended at least Werner's course (Argentieri, 2012), but he should not have completed the first year since he is not enrolled in the list organized by Carl G. Gottschalk (1866).

²⁵ Costanzo Benedetto Bonvicino (mentioned by Souza Coutinho as Dr. Bonvicino or "Bonvoisin"), was a chemist well known for his work within the field of inorganic chemistry, but also for his contributions to mineralogy, metallurgy and industrial applications, including fabric dyeing etc. He was a member of the Academy of Science and a professor at the University of Turin.

at his tenure as State Secretary of the Navy and Ultramarine, when he actually gave form to his reformist plans with particular implications for the colonial realms.

Bonifácio de Andrada pursued important academic and administrative functions related to mineralogy and mining after his experience at the *Bergakademie*, becoming professor of Metallurgy at the University of Coimbra and Superintendent of Mines and Metals of the Portuguese Kingdom. He would be years later one of the "founding fathers" of the Brazilian state in the independence process, with strong influence in the political directions of the young nation. Manuel Ferreira da Câmara after studied in Paris and Freiberg and having visited many mining areas in Transylvania and Banat, Sweden, Norway, Denmark and England, returned to Portugal in 1798 and immediately joined the inner circle of Sousa Coutinho, being appointed few years latter as Superintendent of Mines and Diamonds in Minas Gerais (Brazil).

Minas Gerais (where Câmara was born) was the heart of the gold production and the main mining area of the Portuguese empire. For there, Souza Coutinho and Câmara devised a plan for reforming the mining activity and gold taxation, which was directly influenced by the cameralist model adopted in Transylvania. The plan was informed by Câmara's travels in Hungary (where he wrote in 1796 a 'Note on mining extraction in the Principality of Transylvania') and resulted in a long and detailed Royal Decree from 1803 with the new directives for mining activities in Minas Gerais, which was directly written by Câmara, and revised, endorsed and presented to the monarch by Souza Coutinho.²⁶

The collaboration between these two naturalists, Bonifácio de Andrada and Câmara, and Souza Coutinho were in fact instrumental to the promotion of the useful knowledge of the natural world within the Portuguese enlightened reformism and included many cameralist ingredients. The topics of Freiberg's lessons would echo in their correspondence, and in the many documents and plans on forestry, mineral exploration, metallurgy, the creation of schools of mines inspired by the *Bergakademie*, legislation and administrative and fiscal structure related to mineral exploration, to the kingdom and colonies, it is possible to see the inspiration of the cameralist models.

5. Final considerations: elements of a complex transmission

As mentioned above, a prominent subset of the *estrangeirados* group corresponds to men such as the Marquis of Pombal or Souza Coutinho who, after their career as diplomats in foreign countries, would return to Portugal to perform leading State functions, in which they would benefit from their contact with different circuits of intellectual exchange and specific lineages of European thinking with particular interest to governance. In the Portuguese case, the expansion of the scope of diplomatic relations throughout the eighteenth century is as much a result of this phenomenon as it is a factor that contributes to the amplification of this circulation process. In this sense, it is interesting to observe not only the trajectories of the names that would occupy high functions of state

17

²⁶ On the connection between Câmara's writings on mining activities in Transylvania, the connection of this with the cameralist models and the adaptation of these ideas to the Brazilian context, see Cunha 2011 and 2017b.

after their return to Portugal but also the whole constellation of Portuguese diplomatic agents that, in a collective way, although with variable competence, ended up reproducing the modus operandi of observation of the specificities of the foreign country, collecting strategic information about different fields and reflecting on business opportunities. Although the case of Souza Coutinho has been highlighted here, several other names that were important for the materialization of enlightened reformism, even without assuming such important functions in the central administration of the kingdom, could also be remembered.

In order to address the international diffusion of cameralist ideas in the eighteenth century (and, more broadly, the question of the diffusion of economic and political ideas during the period), we must bear in mind that it does not necessarily imply the transmission of a specific, well-defined and complete set of ideas or doctrines. From the point of view of the recipients in this process, it seems above all that the most important aspect is to assimilate or emulate certain ideas, concepts or practices and not the apprehension of a system of ideas or a broad doctrinal framework. Specific ideas were selected because they connected to particular topics of interest or to concrete problems, and they functioned as a way to single out certain cameralist ideas to travel to other contexts without implying a collective vision. Examples of this assimilation are the search for instruments to improve financial management or for responses to fiscal problems or population dynamics. Understanding the diffusion of cameralism in places far from the Germanic world, for instance in the Iberian world of the eighteenth century, entails a renewed attention to these aspects. This process is primarily a dissemination of "certain cameralist ideas" and not the transmission of a comprehensive system of ideas.²⁷

The dissemination of the cameralist ideas not as a cohesive frame of ideas, but as certain elements that can be eventually combined with other set of doctrines was possible due to some characteristics of the cameralist discourse itself. Rather a piecemeal discourse than a well-ordered doctrine, it is interesting to note that the cameralist discourse, in spite of having searched for fixation as a body of knowledge in many textbooks such as those produced by Justi and others, was greatly marked, particularly in the eighteenth century, by porosity and plasticity in its encounter with the enlightenment framework of economic and political ideas. And regarding the processes of ideas transfer, and in particular on the reception in other parts of certain elements of that cameralist discourse marked by plasticity and porosity, it is also interesting to note the possibility opened for the receptors of simply ignore the origin of these ideas and assume them as part of a wider common heritage.

The spread of cameralism in this sense may have occurred without ever being recognized by their recipients as an importation. Throughout the eighteenth century the promotion of a language of political governance was specified and deepened. The use of this language in particular for the conduct of state reforms was marked by the perception that a certain common heritage of perspectives for action were shared across the world of Enlightenment.

The subdivisions of economic thought in distinct schools such as French, Italian or Scottish one in the period, respond to a kind of discourse on the

-

²⁷ See Cunha 2017b.

evolution of economic ideas that would only take shape a many years after and that does not properly correspond to how these ideas were understood at the time they were produced. In some cases, assimilated ideas may have been assumed to belong to the same set of ideas already adopted by recipients since the ends were the same. However, if we analysed those pieces (such as Souza Coutinho's *Discurso*) from the conventional map of segmentations of economic ideas often used to understand the emergence of political economy as autonomous knowledge from the eighteenth century onwards, what we will probably find is an incongruent combination of very different doctrinal structures and not the cohesive discursive piece planned by the authors. There is in this sense an inadequacy of this traditional conceptual map of the history of economic ideas for the interpretation of the economic discourse of the second half of the eighteenth century and in particular for the understanding of the cameralist discourse in its encounter with the enlightenment reformism.

From the examples analysed here, in particular Souza Coutinho's interest by the cameralist experiences in his reflections on mendicancy, an important point to be highlighted is precisely the possibility of the assimilation of some cameralist ideas as part of a common and broader universe of concepts. What is understood here as "certain cameralist elements" that can be identified in the economic discourse of enlightened reformism points to the dissemination of some of these cameralist ideas that could pragmatically be interesting for a reformist view of state administration but also to an interesting interplay between cameralist ideas and other continental sources. There is thus both "influence" and "convergence." We must therefore redouble our efforts and sharpen our vision to see what the distinctive elements of each case are to attempt to explain how and from which common elements of convergences take place.

In a variety of ways, but never as a direct and easily discernible result of a linear process of transmission of ideas and, as a rule, only as one of many elements of a composite result, cameralist ideas played a role in Portuguese economic and political thought of the second half of the eighteenth century, with important implications for the form that enlightened reformism assumed there.

Fragments of cameralist practices and teachings were included in the recipe for enlightened reformism in Portugal as a result of the combination of interest both from the emulation of models, institutions and practices for governmental action or reformist plans and from answers that were collected from varied literary sources, stemming from a wide range of ideas with specific origins and affiliations, which were often assumed simply to be part of a common heritage of ideas about economic governance and the science of the legislator. Even though cameralist flavours are not always easily discernible in this recipe for Portuguese enlightened reformism (which is also true for many other "spices" present there), they undoubtedly formed an inseparable part of its preparation.

4. References

[Gama, Bernardo José da]. 1823. Resumo das instituições políticas do Barão de Bielfeld, parafraseadas e acomodadas à forma actual do governo do Império do

- Brasil, oferecido à mocidade brasiliense por um seu compatriota pernambucano. Rio de Janeiro: Tipografia Nacional.
- [Leopold II]. 1790. *Governo della Toscana sotto il regno di sua Maestà il Rè Leopoldo II*. Firenze: Gaetano Cambiagi.
- Argentieri, Alessio. 2012. "Napione, Carlo Antonio". *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani (Vol. 77: Morlini-Natolini)*. Roma: Istituto della Enciclopedia italiana.
- Backhaus, Ursula. 2008. "Johann Heinrich Gottlob von Justi (1717-1771): health as part of a state's capital endowment" in: *The beginnings of political economy: Johann Heinrich Gottlob von Justi.*, edited by Jürgen G. Backhaus. New York, NY: Springer.
- Bielfeld, Jacob Friedrich von. 1760. *Institutions politiques* (vol.1). Haye: Chez Pierre Gosse.
- Bousquet, G.-H. 1960. *Esquisse d'une histoire de la science économique en Italie; des origines à Francesco Ferrara*. Paris: M. Rivière.
- Büsching, Anton Friedrich. 1773-1787. Wöchentliche Nachrichten von neuen Landcharten und geographischen, statistischen und historischen Büchern und Schriften. Berlin: Haude und Spener.
- Büsching, Anton Friedrich. 1787. *Magazin für die neue Historie und Geographie*. Halle: Curt.
- Cardoso, José Luís. 2015. "Liberalism and enlightened political economy". *The European Journal of the History of Economic Thought*, 22:6, 934-948.
- Cardoso, José Luís, and Alexandre Mendes Cunha. 2012. "Enlightened Reforms and Economic Discourse in the Portuguese-Brazilian Empire (1750-1808)". *History of Political Economy.* 44 (4): 619-642.
- Cardoso, José Luís. 2018. "Rodrigo de Sousa Coutinho a Torino: cultura economica e formazione politica di un diplomatico illuminato" in "Tanto ella assume novitate al fianco". Lisbona, Torino e gli scambi culturali fra secolo dei Lumi e Restaurazione. Edited by I. F. Mota and C. E. Spantigati. Roma: Carocci Editore [forthcoming].
- Carneiro, Ana, Maria Paula Diogo, and Ana Simões. 2000. "Enlightenment science in Portugal: the estrangeirados and their communication networks". *Social Studies of Science*. 30.
- Carolino, Luís Miguel. 2013. "O poder dos livros. A biblioteca de Rodrigo de Sousa Coutinho". *Revista do Instituto Histórico-Geográfico Brasileiro*, 174 (460): 109-140.
- Cunha, Alexandre Mendes. 2010. "Police Science and Cameralism in Portuguese Enlightened Reformism: economic ideas and the administration of the state during the second half of the 18th century. *e-Journal of Portuguese History*, vol. 8(1).
- Cunha, Alexandre Mendes. 2011. "Metalurgia, mineração e cameralismo: superposições entre as ciências naturais e a economia política no reformismo ilustrado luso-brasileiro" in: *Actas do Congresso Luso-Brasileiro de História das Ciências*, edited by Carlos Fiolhais, Carlota Simões and Décio Martins. Coimbra: Imprensa da Universidade de Coimbra.
- Cunha, Alexandre Mendes. 2017a. "A Previously Unnoticed Swiss Connection in the Dissemination of Cameralist Ideas during the Second Half of the Eighteenth Century". *History of Political Economy.* 49 (3): 497-530.
- Cunha, Alexandre Mendes. 2017b. "Administrative Centralisation, Police Regulations and Mining Sciences as Channels for the Dissemination of

- Cameralist Ideas in the Iberian World" in: *Cameralism in practice: state administration and economy in early modern Europe*, edited by Marten Seppel and Keith Tribe. Suffolk, UK: Boydell & Brewer.
- Darnton, Robert. 1979. *The business of enlightenment: a publishing history of the Encyclopédie, 1775-1800.* Cambridge (Mass.): Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- Delamare, Nicolas. 1705–1738. Traité de la police (...). Paris: J. et P. Cot.
- Duchesne. 1758. Code de la police (...). Paris: Prault.
- Fréminville, Edme de. 1758. *Dictionnaire ou traité de la police générale des villes* (...). Paris: Gissey.
- Foucault, Michel. 2009. History of madness. London: Routledge.
- Foucault, Michel. 2010. *The birth of biopolitics: lectures at the Collège de France,* 1978-79 (edited by Michel Senellart). Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Gottschalk, Carl Gottlieb. 1866. "Verzeichniss derer, welche seit Eröffnung der Bergakademie bis zum Schluss des ersten Säculum's auf ihr studirt Haben" in: Festschrift zum hundertjährigen Jubiläum der Königl. sächs bergakademie zu Freiberg, am 30. Juli 1866. Dresden: Druck der K. Hofbuchdruckerei von C.C. Meinhold & Söhne.
- Justi, Johann Heinrich Gottlob von. 1760/61. *Die Grundfeste zu der Macht und Glückseligkeit der Staaten* (...). Königsberg: Gerhard Luddewig Woltersdorfs Wittwe.
- Justi, Johann Heinrich Gottlob von. 1761/4. Gesammlete Politische und Finanzschriften über wichtige Gegenstände der Staatskunst, der Kriegswissenschaften und des Cameral- und Finanzwesens. Koppenhagen und Leipzig.
- Justi, Johann Heinrich Gottlob von. 1769[1756]. *Eléments généraux de police* démontrés par des raisonnemens fondés sur l'object & la fin qu'elle se propose. Paris: chez Rozet.
- Justi, Johann Heinrich Gottlob von. 1756. *Grundsätze der Policey-Wissenschaft in einen vernünftigen, auf den Endzweck der Policey gegründeten, Zusammenhange und zum Gebrauch academischer Vorlesungen abgefasset.* Göttingen: Vandenhoeck.
- Macedo, Jorge Borges de. 1974. "Estrangeirados: um conceito a rever". *Bracara Augusta*, v. 28, fasc. 65-66 (77-78). Braga: Livraria Cruz.
- Magalhães, Joaquim Romero. 2004. "O projecto de D. Luís da Cunha para o império português" in: *Estudos em homenagem a Luís António de Oliveira Ramos*. Edited by Luís A. de Oliveira Ramos and Francisco Ribeiro da Silva. Porto: Faculdade de Letras da Universidade do Porto.
- Mansuy-Diniz Silva, Andrée. 1991. "As idéias políticas de um Homem das Luzes na época da Revolução Francesa: dom Rodrigo de Sousa Coutinho" In: *Portugal no século XVIII: de dom João V à Revolução Francesa*. Sociedade Portuguesa de Estudos do século XVIII. Lisboa: Universitária Editora.
- Mansuy-Diniz Silva, Andrée. 2002. *D. Rodrigo de Souza Coutinho, comte de Linhares: 1755-1812: portrait d'un homme d'Etat. I, I.* Paris: Centre culturel Calouste Gulbenkian.
- Mansuy-Diniz Silva, Andrée. 2006. *D. Rodrigo de Souza Coutinho, comte de Linhares: 1755-1812: portrait d'un homme d'État. II, II*. Lisbonne: Centre culturel Calouste Gulbenkian.

- Maxwell, Kenneth. 1995. *Pombal: paradox of the Enlightenment*. Cambridge [U.K.]: Cambridge University Press.
- Paquette, Gabriel. 2014. *Imperial Portugal in the Age of Atlantic Revolutions the Luso-Brazilian World, c.1770-1850*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Santos, Nívia Pombo Cirne dos. 2009. "Um turista na Corte do Piemonte dom Rodrigo de Souza Coutinho e o Iluminismo italiano e francês (1778-1790)". *Varia História.* 25 (41): 213-225.
- Screpanti, Ernesto, and Stefano Zamagni. 1993. An outline of the history of economic thought. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Seppel, Marten, and Keith Tribe (eds.). 2017. *Cameralism in practice: state administration and economy in early modern Europe*. Suffolk, UK: Boydell & Brewer.
- Smith, Adam. 1904 [1776]. *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations by Adam Smith*. Edited with an Introduction, Notes, Marginal Summary and an Enlarged Index by Edwin Cannan. London: Methuen.
- Souza Coutinho, Rodrigo de. 1993. *Textos políticos, económicos e financeiros (1783–1811)*. Vol. 1. Edited by Andrée Mansuy Diniz Silva. Lisbon: Banco de Portugal.
- Storrs, Christopher. 2009. "The Savoyard State: another Enlightened despotism?" in: *Enlightened reform in Southern Europe and its Atlantic colonies, c. 1750-1830*, edited by Gabriel Paquette. Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- Storrs, Christopher. 2015. "Savoyard diplomacy in the eighteenth century (1684-1798)" in: *Politics and diplomacy in early modern Italy: the structure of diplomatic practice, 1450-1800*, edited by Daniela Frigo. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tribe, Keith. 2017. "Baltic Cameralism?" in: *Cameralism in practice: state administration and economy in early modern Europe*, edited by Marten Seppel and Keith Tribe. Suffolk, UK: Boydell & Brewer.
- Vasco, Giambattista. 1790. *Mémoire sur les causes de la mendicité et sur les moyens de la supprimer*. Turin: Chez Honoré Derossi.
- Young, Arthur. 1793. *Travels during the years 1787, 1788 and 1789: undertaken more particularly with a view of ascertaining the cultivation, wealth, resources, and national prosperity, of the kingdom of France.* Dublin: Printed for R. Cross.